The monumental district of Florence/Italy and the workers’ quarter Kiel-Gaarden/Germany are two case studies on the use of mapping for storyscapes on different levels.

Architectural heritage is most commonly understood to be representable and representative of a nation, city or cultural group. Not only in the aftermath of armed confrontation, is a re-assessment of what should be considered worthy of preservation and remembrance necessary, but it becomes perhaps a matter of every generation to re-evaluate of what matters in the built environment as part of an identity-shaping process. Part of this on-going process could be coming to terms with the historic past, and to include the forgotten aspects and events, which had shaped to some extent the lives of a group of people, communities or entire nations. In heritage studies, this contested heritage is known for instance as “shared heritage”, “uncomfortable heritage”, and places may be even described as “traumascapes”.

What is known as the “spatial turn” occurred roughly 20 years ago. It is employed in the humanities where cartographic maps become a methodological tool. It is not a new approach to understand the historic context through space and in space, but it has undergone a re-launch because mass data can be processed and linked to a GIS. When this data becomes available online, trans- and interdisciplinary research is facilitated with a possibility to open up new perspectives and research fields. Especially in the area of architectural heritage, a field still largely dominated by expertise, this method may act as an inclusive and democratic tool for communities, which are not yet an integral part of a heritage discourse. It also provides an opportunity to integrate new heritage topics and places to be – if not preserved so at least – remembered.

By visualizing for instance an urban space and the different places with a variety of functions and events, links between them can be revealed, which otherwise would have gone unnoticed. What has been termed in this context a “deep map” is “a finely detailed, multimedia depiction of place and the people, animals, and objects that exist within it, and are thus inseparable from the contours and rhythms of everyday life. Deep maps are not confined to the tangible or material, but include the discursive and ideological dimensions of place, the dreams, hopes, and fears of residents – they are, in short, positioned between matter and meanings. [...] It is simultaneously a platform, a process, and a product. It is an environment embedded with tools to bring data into an explicit and direct relationship with space and time.”

The relationship between space and human activity is well reflected in sociology stating that “space cannot be [...] distinguished from society, but it is a specific form of society. Spatial structures are, just like temporal structures, forms of social structures”. That means that space and human activity constitute elements of heritage. At the same time, digitalisation has a decisive impact on the possibility for accessing primary data, for creating maps with this data, and to share these maps. Two case studies will demonstrate here how the map-based reconstruction of spatial activity helps to reveal different approaches to social realities. The case studies examine very different places and situations and will illustrate the potential of deep mapping to generate attention for hitherto neglected facets of life in urban spaces.

---

1 BTU Cottbus-Senftenberg, Chair of Architectural Preservation.
2 BTU Cottbus-Senftenberg, Chair of Architectural Preservation.
3 According to the ICOMOS committee, “Shared Built Heritage includes historical urban and rural structures or elements, resulting from multi-cultural and/ or colonial influence”. Connected to this heritage would be, though, not only sites emblematic of colonisation and slavery, but also places which in present-day context are relevant for different cultural groups sharing the space, but that would be associated with different values. Enders, ‘ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Shared Built Heritage. Its History, Work and Role in the Preservation and Conservation of Transcultural Heritage’, 29. Norbert Huse (1941-2013), German art historian, has distinguished three different categories of uncomfortable heritage, mostly in the context of German heritage and spaces linked to the National Socialist era and the GDR. Huse, Unbequeme Baudenkmale. The cultural historian Maria Tumarkin explores the destructive effects of war and terrorist attacks through the places associated with these events. Tumarkin, Traumascapes.
4 Bodenhamer, ‘Narrating Space and Place’, 7.
6 Löw, Raumsoziologie, 167.
Universal heritage in 19th century Florence

The Tuscan city Florence, known worldwide for its Renaissance art and architecture, had already been part of the Grand Tour, becoming even more interesting from the first half of the 19th century, and can – in terms of heritage values – surely be regarded as a place of universal significance (fig. 1). The monuments mentioned in guide books can be seen as the essence of expert-driven and thus universally acknowledged heritage sites. With this selection the importance of these sites is reinforced. Thus, the notion of key monuments is the result of a top-down approach to evaluate cultural heritage. This perspective still prevails in most cases for tangible heritage, but it limits a more holistic perspective.

Figure 2 shows a map based on the information of a 1867 city guide in which the areas of churches, represented in pink, are mentioned and which were believed to be of interest for a tourist. However, many more, albeit smaller churches existed that are still noteworthy for the religious communities and the city history in general (fig. 3). The graphical representation of heritage in the shape of a pyramid demonstrates the different levels of heritage, according to their importance from a personal, shown at the bottom in red, up to the universal significance in yellow at the top (fig. 4).

When tourists came to Florence, and explored the city with the help of guide books, these visitors moved within the city space with its officially recognized monuments. But if we consider the movement within an environment with different human activities, we see that also other realities coexist. These parallel spaces – usually not officially constituting national or local heritage – contributed however to the entire experience of the visitor. This is exemplified by a newspaper article that appeared on September 2, 1887 in the Florentine newspaper “La Nazione”, where a letter of one of their readers was published, informing us,

“Thus, it happens often that I meet in Via della Scala, at the corner of Via del Porcellana, foreigners with a guide book in their hands, who cannot decide to take such a dirty street to reach their hotel, maybe because they cannot believe that it is the right street, which is indicated in their guide book as the shortest from the [train] station and from a centre such as Santa Maria Novella, to their hotel such as Pace, Ville and Italia!”

These hotels were located along the river Arno (fig. 5) around Piazza Manin, today’s Piazza Ognissanti, and were considered to be located in one of “the most elegant and finest areas of Florence, and where there are the most beautiful hotels of the city.”

What the anonymous author referred to were the bordello hotspots in Florence that were situated amongst other streets in that quarter in the Via del Porcellana, as indicated by the turquoise dots (figs. 6 and 7). This was also an area, where in the past centuries the labourers working in the production of woolen textiles had worked, and where bordellos had been established in vicinity to cater to this clientele.

The stories connected to the experiences of the parallel spaces may be detached from the honourable, officially communicated history, but ignoring them, prevents us from understanding the space of the city with its multi-layered inter-relations. One particular facet of everyday life, which is presented here in an exemplary way, is represented by ten thousands of documents compiled by the police and stored at the State Archive in Florence. They reveal the clashes in everyday life of a contested sub-culture with respectable society. The documents cover a period when prostitution in post-unified Italy was not forbidden but tolerated, and where the state regulated and sanctioned urban space for the setting up of bordellos.

On May 23, 1873 Mister Carpenty from England had sojourned in the Hotel New York at the river Arno, when he was solicited by a woman on the Via Refe Nero. This street is located between two main shopping streets, the Via Calzaiuoli and Via Tornabuoni (figs. 8 and 9). This woman had pulled him into a house, forcing herself onto him. But, according to the police report, he managed to escape, but not without having to pay her 5 Lire, after she had called some men, who beat him up and showed him the bottom in red, up to the universal significance in yellow at the top (fig. 4).

On September 2, 1887 in the Florentine newspaper “La Nazione”, where a letter of one of their readers was published, informing us,

“Thus, it happens often that I meet in Via della Scala, at the corner of Via del Porcellana, foreigners with a guide book in their hands, who cannot decide to take such a dirty street to reach their hotel, maybe because they cannot believe that it is the right street, which is indicated in their guide book as the shortest from the [train] station and from a centre such as Santa Maria Novella, to their hotel such as Pace, Ville and Italia!”

These hotels were located along the river Arno (fig. 5) around Piazza Manin, today’s Piazza Ognissanti, and were considered to be located in one of “the most elegant and finest areas of Florence, and where there are the most beautiful hotels of the city.”

What the anonymous author referred to were the bordello hotspots in Florence that were situated amongst other streets in that quarter in the Via del Porcellana, as indicated by the turquoise dots (figs. 6 and 7). This was also an area, where in the past centuries the labourers working in the production of woolen textiles had worked, and where bordellos had been established in vicinity to cater to this clientele.

The stories connected to the experiences of the parallel spaces may be detached from the honourable, officially communicated history, but ignoring them, prevents us from understanding the space of the city with its multi-layered inter-relations. One particular facet of everyday life, which is presented here in an exemplary way, is represented by ten thousands of documents compiled by the police and stored at the State Archive in Florence. They reveal the clashes in everyday life of a contested sub-culture with respectable society. The documents cover a period when prostitution in post-unified Italy was not forbidden but tolerated, and where the state regulated and sanctioned urban space for the setting up of bordellos.

On May 23, 1873 Mister Carpenty from England had sojourned in the Hotel New York at the river Arno, when he was solicited by a woman on the Via Refe Nero. This street is located between two main shopping streets, the Via Calzaiuoli and Via Tornabuoni (figs. 8 and 9). This woman had pulled him into a house, forcing herself onto him. But, according to the police report, he managed to escape, but not without having to pay her 5 Lire, after she had called some men, who beat him up and chased him away.

Close to the Palazzo Vecchio, under the Logge of the Uffizi was a meeting point, where during the day and night roughly 15 procurers and prostitutes came together (figs. 10). According to an anonymous letter to the police, their shameful behaviour was causing scandal in these times with the presence of foreigners with their use of vulgar language and curses. This event and

---

7 Specific city guides have been published since the end of the 18th century. For a comprehensive bibliography on the Florentine city guides, see Gonnelli, 1999, Firenze in tasca. Immagine artistica di una città attraverso e guide dell'Ottocento.
8 Fratelli Pellas, Firenze in tasca ovvero una gita di piacere alla capitale.
9 “Talchò [sic!] succede spesso di incontrare in Via della Scala, allo svolto di Via del Porcellana, i forestieri colla loro guida alla mano, che non sanno indursi a prendere per una strada così sudicia per recarsi si loro Hôtels, forse perché non par loro vero che possa esser quella la strada, che la pianta della loro guida segna come la più comoda per chi da Stazione, e da un centro come Santa Maria Novella, si reca per esempio agli Alberghi della Pace, della Ville e d’Italia!”
10 “[...] ai Quartiere del Lungarni, uno dei più eleganti e signorili di Firenze, dove sono i più belle alberghi della città” La Nazione, “Truce Fatto”, 2.
11 Questura, ‘Box 15’, dossier 16 F, May 23, 1873.

32

Alexandra Skedzuhn-Safir & Peter I. Schneider

---
many other situations had been part of the everyday life not only of foreigners visiting the city, but of Florentines as well, who lived in the neighbourhood of the numerous bordellos, spread out all over the city. It is also the story of the many women who worked in this business, most of whom were forced out of economic necessity to choose this occupation, and often exploited by madams and the system at large. Ultimately, it is the story of double standards, and of a society, that enabled the tolerated system of prostitution, while the re-integration of ostracized and criminalised prostitutes into society was rendered more than difficult. Only some citizens profited from this system, in which government taxed prostitutes and bordello owners. These reports thus reflect the stories of individuals or of sub-cultures of this period, for many however they represent an uncomfortable side of society. As contested as it may be, it still constitutes part of Florentine history, but has not left any visible marks in the urban fabric. Therefore, it deserves even more so to be remembered, not only because it is part of the identity of a small and ostracized group, but shapes ultimately the history of society in the latter half of the 19th century, reflecting its values, troubles and morality. Although this historical reality has long past, the uncomfortable side of it has not decreased. Thus, it is perhaps even more important to acknowledge this historical fact, and employ it to as a basis to address contemporary issues.

Secret Gaarden

Compared to the landmark Renaissance and Baroque churches of Florence, one will not fail to assume a lesser global significance to most places in Kiel, a German harbour city located at the Baltic Sea, and in particular to Kiel-Gaarden, a traditional workers’ quarter. Still, there are also officially recognized and listed monuments in that quarter, mostly public buildings and historic settlements from the 1st half of the 20th century. These officially listed monuments could be placed to the medium levels of the heritage pyramid from local to national significance (pyramid on fig. 11, bottom right corner). The cadastre of monuments is integrated into the official GIS of the municipality and available online for the general public. Within the GIS, the listed monuments are represented on the online map in different colours, according to different categories like buildings, or open spaces. This, however, does not yet represent a ‘deep map’ according to the concept Bodenhamer et al.

The quarter of Kiel-Gaarden is linked to the development of the German Imperial Marine since the 1870s. After the declaration of Kiel as the ‘Imperial Harbour’ of the German Empire in the 1870s, the quarter next to the wharfs did not attract only ten thousands of immigrants from the various German states as workers, but also a great number of local middle-class investors and merchants who built the new neighbourhoods with respectable middle class houses. In WW 2 many of the buildings had been heavily damaged and torn down, but still, many buildings and some streets maintained the 19th and early 20th centuries’ character of the place. But, even if rebuilt after the war with the addition of new buildings replacing the lost ones, the quarter changed considerably: many refugees from the lost parts of Eastern Germany had to be required living space in the late 1940s and 1950s, and from the 1960s many immigrant workers came from southern Europe. Already in the 1970s and 1980s the quarter faced serious problems concerning the living conditions as a consequence of lacking investment by the house owners, in general private middle class proprietors. The municipality managed to improve the investment situation and the living conditions, and locals were able to regain self-confidence as inhabitants of a vivid quarter.

And again, at the beginning of the 21st century, the situation turned for the worse. Half a decade ago, the quarter of Kiel-Gaarden had another problem: the news reported of the decadence of the formerly respectable worker’s quarter to a ‘No-Go-Area’. After all, the situation at Kiel-Gaarden served as an excellent case study in sociology on the “Middle Class in Socially Disadvantaged Quarters” as well as on social work in the context of gentrification. The starting point of Masson’s study is the issue of segregation, driving better-off parts of the population out of neighbourhoods that are in continuous need for inclusion and stabilized identity. Fostering self-consciousness and identity can be regarded as one strategy to promote social cohesion. At Kiel Gaarden, several initiatives started to address this problem by activating heritage and story-telling projects concerned with ‘everyday life’ in the past. One of these initiatives for examples is the “Workshop on Local History”, held at
the Adult Education Centre of Kiel. Mostly elderly people from Gaarden participated in this workshop to collect and share memories, that centered on the topic of “everyday life” in the past. As one outcome, the website of the workshop presents the memories that are arranged according to different themes like the living conditions in the 1920s and 1930s, documenting from memory the use, the furniture and the organisation of an apartment of an average worker’s family.21

Other initiatives are the activities of the ‘Gaardian’. One of the offers the Gaardian presents is the figure of an elder inhabitant22 of the quarter who writes and reads historical stories focus on the quarter.23 One of his topics is the shops and merchants of Kiel-Gaarden, a topic to which he dedicated a book last year: “Doings and Dealing in History and in Stories”.24 It is a book about shops and inns as central reference points of everyday-life in the past, subject to dramatic changes in the 1980s and 1990s due to changes in the general economic framework for retail all over Europe. For his research Ehlert talked to many autochthonous people, the old shop owners or to their heirs, collecting memories, family accounts and privately owned photographs.

Like the monuments mentioned in the city guide of Florence, these shops – and others mentioned in local history publications – can be mapped to visualize the storyscape of meeting spaces for retail, entertainment and neighbourhood. The black symbols on fig. 11 then represent the actively remembered shops and inns. By adding the complete information of shops, taverns and other reference points of everyday life from the old directories (red symbols on fig. 11), which are easily online accessible today25, we will recognize immediately the difference between the actively remembered topography of everyday life and the historical situation: there are far more reference points to be mapped. It seems as if the mentioned publication reflects the collective memory of those only who still live there.

With this we would like to turn to one of those small shops that are not remembered in a shared way: it is a little grocery shop at the fringe of Gaarden (marked with an arrow on fig. 11). This shop was bought in the 1930s by the offspring of a first-generation immigrant worker, and provided a possibility to climb the social ladder. And the heritage of that shop takes us to the lowest, personal level of the heritage pyramid.

The family of the shop owner managed to climb up gradually the ladder of social status through the benefits gained from their new, modest enterprise as grocers (see fig. 12). On the other hand, the family of the cousin faced a different fate, which resulted in the revealing of family secrets. The story of this family branch is told by the cousin’s granddaughter, who researched her family history. Making an unsettling discovery about her grandfather, she then openly shared the dark sides of the ‘families’ secret’ by publishing it on the internet, excluding however the most immorally questionable details. On her website, that is family history. Making an unsettling discovery about her grandfather, she then openly shared the dark sides of the ‘families’ secret’ by publishing it on the internet, excluding however the most immorally questionable details. On her website, that is family history.

There could be several reasonably explanations why the granddaughter publicly exposes her family history, but we can only speculate.27 Nevertheless, the way in which she presents it, speaks for itself: it must have been something that shocked the granddaughter still 70 years later. In fact, the family history research she had just carried out corresponds to what has gained recognition in psychological therapy and in medical studies during the last two decades. The widely recognized French psychologist Anne Ancelin Schützenberger (1988) pointed to the impact of traumata rooted in family secrets and how they may

---

21 “Geschichtswerkstatt Gaarden” [Workshop on local history]: www.geschichtswerkstatt-gaarden.de. Project by adult education centre Kiel, funded by state office for political education, a private local estate and trading company and by EU; On the different themes: ‘Vom Dorf zum Industriestandort’ [From village to a place of industry], ‘Echte Gaardener’ [True Gaardeners], ‘Wohnen in den 20er und 30er Jahren’ [Living in the 20s and 30s], ‘Kindheit und Jugend’ [Childhood and youth], ‘Die Kriegszeit’ [Wartime], ‘Nach 1945’ [After 1945].


24 Ehlert 2016, Carstens 2016.

25 The information on shops and other reference points of public life in Kiel-Gaarden is taken – exemplarily – from the directories for the city of Kiel for the years 1914 and 1934.


27 We do not know, but we can recognize a deep desire to share her story. But – to whom or to which ends? We can only speculate: To free herself from a family trauma in the most drastic way possible? To unknown relatives? Or in order to build a bridge to her unknown illegitimate aunts, that her grandfather had fathered besides his two legitimate children, a kinship she had just newly learned about in the course of her research?
seriously harm individuals for several generations. The confrontation with them can, though, be a key approach in the healing process. Family histories, like the one based at Kiel-Gaarden, are individual, personal stories, which contribute to self-assertion both on an individual and family level. The narrations of family histories are located on a personal level, their research and mapping being supported by easy access to archival resources and directories. Coming to terms with the personal history finally allows individuals to establish their relations to existing communities of wider, shared significance – be it on local or community levels or be it on even higher levels.

Conclusion

Digital maps, especially in the form of deep maps, are the instruments for the revelation and communication of these stories. Digital maps are dependent on access to all kinds of data of everyday life. The maps themselves are conceived as open to addition of further research results. They are never finished and act as a placeholder. In this sense – as Bodenhammer et al. argued – the maps "do not explicitly seek authority or objectivity but provoke negotiation between insiders and outsiders, experts and contributors, over what is represented and how. Framed as a conversation but not a statement", these maps allow bringing societal problems into focus.

The seemingly clashing positions of the top-down and the bottom-up approaches towards heritage, and its communication can be reconciled by providing accessible maps with different perspectives, and to include not only marginalised issues but also individuals into the heritage discourse.

In this sense it visualises the effects man has on space, and space shaping historic events, which relates to the spatial theory of Löw, in which space provokes and enables specific actions, and events influence the construction of space.

Bibliography


Fratelli Pellias. Firenze in tasca ovvero una gita di piacere alla capitale [Florence at hand or a trip to the capital]. 2nd ed. Firenze e Genova: Fratelli Pellias, 1867.


Killisch, Winfried F. ‘Zur sozialräumlichen Struktur eines innerstädtischen Großstadtberichtes – dargestellt am Beispiel


La Nazione. 'Truce Fatto' [Cruel fact]. La Nazione. 2 September 1887.


edniebrown_2009_earthtextspacetime.pdf.

Questura, ‘Box 15’, dossier 16 F, Archivio di Stato Firenze, May 23, 1873.


Websites

Geschichtswerkstatt Gaarden [workshop on local history]: www. geschichtswerkstatt-gaarden.de:


Fig. 1
The baptistery (top left) and the bell tower (top right) of the Cathedral Santa Maria del Fiore are key monuments in Florence (bottom). As heritage sites they can be considered to have universal significance (Giorgio Sommer, n.d., Deutsche Digitale Bibliothek).
Fig. 2
The churches shown in pink represent those places of touristic attraction according to the city guide Firenze in tasca ovvero una gita di piacere alla capitale published in 1867 by Pellas (Skedzuhn-Safir; drawing by Diaz, 2018 and based on the Florentine cadastre map of 1833 F.1).

Fig. 3
Except for the churches mentioned in the guide book of 1867, many more Catholic churches existed and shown here in purple, but apparently were not considered to be as important. The choice of one choosing edifice over the other reflects an expert-driven selection of importance (Skedzuhn-Safir; drawing by Diaz, 2018; based on the Florentine cadastre m
One manner in which heritage can be distinguished is according to the levels of significance. The importance for a single person is shown in red at the bottom, while yellow at the top signifies the universal one.

Fig. 5
The Northern promenades along the river Arno were dotted with hotels and pensions. The most elegant ones were located near the Piazza Manin, the present-day Piazza Ognissanti. To the North of this area were several of Florence’s legalised bordellos (Photo: Private collection of the author, post stamp dates from 1902).
On the way from Florence’s main train station to the elegant hotels along the river Arno, tourists would have passed the Via del Porcellana, one of the hotspots of tolerated prostitution, prompting thus a Florentine citizen to lament this situation in a letter to the newspaper “La Nazione” (Skedzuhn-Safir; drawing by Diaz, 2018; based on the Florentine cadastre map of 1833 F.1).
Via Calzaiuoli and Via Tornabuoni were two of the busiest streets of Florence, lined with restaurants, cafes and shops. An English tourist had reportedly been solicited by a woman in Via Refenero (orange zigzag line), a street between the two main shopping areas in the former Ghetto, another well-known red-light district in the heart of the city (Skedzuhn-Safir; drawing by Diaz, 2018; based on the Florentine cadastre map of 1833 F.1; Photo: Private collection of the author; post stamp dates from 1903).
Under the logge of the Uffizi, at the famous art gallery and point of touristic interest, prostitutes and procurers convened, who were reported to scandalise visitors and citizens with their behaviour (Photo: Giorgio Sommer, 1875, Deutsche Digitale Bibliothek).
Fig. 11

Map of Kiel-Gaarden indicating shops, inns, taverns and other reference points of “everyday life”. Whereas the black symbols refer to establishments during the 20th century (according to Ehlert 2016 and Voerde et al. 1961), the red symbols indicate similar places of the first third of the 20th century, according to the directories of 1914 and 1934 (Schneider on base map: www.ims.kiel.de).
Fig. 12